The Town of Washington Grove *Historic Preservation Commission*
PO Box 216, Washington Grove, MD 20880-0216 Tel: (301) 926-2256 – Fax: (301) 926-0111

HPC Review

HPC2019-09-17

for 412 4th Avenue

Owner Bryant Foreman submitted a building permit application with an extensive set of plans for renovation, alteration, and new construction of his cottage at 412 4th Ave. He appeared at the regularly scheduled HPC meeting on September 17, 2019, for the project review. He had previously consulted twice informally with HPC about his project.

General Description: Renovate original cottage; partial restoration, partial alteration, and partial new construction/reconfiguration of addition, on original footprint.

Adequacy of the Documents Submitted: The plans and worksheet were adequate for evaluation of the construction aspects of the project. The owner was present at the review and was able to provide further information on the planned exterior features and details.

Scope of the Project:

The Existing Cottage. The wood shingle front gable two-story Carpenter Gothic cottage measures approximately 16' wide by 30'deep, with an approximately 5' deep porch on the front and north sides. Evenly spaced 4" x 4" posts support an asymmetric visor-style slope roof over the wrapped porch. The posts along the side retain their scroll work ornament. Each slope of the gable roof is pierced by a small peak dormer. The front gable has paired small one-over-one windows, decorative barge board, and a distinctive braced drop finial in the peak. The worksheet indicates the original cottage peak is 21'high. The north and south side walls of the original cottage each have two two-over-two double-hung windows. The rear of the original cottage has a small square 4-lite peak window, under which is attached a lower gable roof addition, approximately 21'wide and 18' deep. It is off center of the cottage gable and closes off the end of the side porch.

Renovation of original cottage will be accomplished by removing and replacing the existing roof while maintaining the original wall and floor framing, to the extent possible. The owner provided the following information: the exterior siding will be horizontal HardiPlank boards (not board and batten as indicated in the plans); new two over two double hung windows will go into the original window openings. There may be some slight revision in window and door openings on the front façade; though the drawings show no trim of openings, the owner indicated they will be consistent with the existing. Fiberglass composition shingles will be used on all roofs.

Plans show the small dormer on the south roof slope will be replaced with an enlarged peak dormer that extends up flush from the south exterior wall and ties into the roof at its peak.

The drawings for the addition show removal of the existing roof and construction of a new upper floor. The peak of the original cottage will extend beyond the original rear wall of the cottage to butt into the new cross gable roof of the addition. New gable windows and three new peak dormers of differing sizes will have double hung two-over-two tempered glass windows. The new peak dormers (two on the rear roof slope and one on the north) will serve to break up the mass of the addition, give the impression of additions over time, and break up the scale of the roof. The new cross-gable roof will be 23'1 ¼" high, or 2 feet higher than the original cottage.

The floor and exterior wall framing are being retained where possible. Its original windows will be replicated with new windows. The only additional footprint in the project is a new 50 sq' rear entrance landing, with steps attached to the house. Otherwise, the whole project is on its original footprint.

Visibility from public ways. The home is visible from Fourth Ave, Fifth Ave, Acorn Lane, Johnson Alley, and Wade Park.

Contributing structure. The house is a listed, contributing pre-1888 resource in the Washington Grove National Register Historic District. It is located in the historic "tent" district of the of the original camp meeting (thus its 37' x 64' lot dimensions) and is one of three similar surviving diminutive Carpenter Gothic cottages which have retained their iconic steep gable roofs and façades. It faces the historic Wade Park.

Nearby Contributing structures. The closest contributing resources are 407 Acorn Lane, 402, 404, 408, 410, 414 and 417 Fourth Ave, and 402, 404, 406, 407, 409, 416, and 418 Fifth Ave.

Compatibility with the historic district and/or existing structure. The owner is congratulated for maintaining the footprint of the house and for his extensive reuse of original fabric. In the restoration areas of the project, original door and window openings will be used and window styles will be replicated. The modern addition is kept to the rear. New construction work will use compatible windows and trim. The numerous and varied rooflines serve to reduce the scale of the new construction. The owner has gone to great lengths to thoroughly insulate the house, thereby extending its useful life and livability. The predominant eave line has been maintained at one story which keeps the scale of the project modest. In addition, a character-defining feature of Grove cottages, including a number of those in the neighborhood of 412 4th Ave., is that they traditionally grew by accretion, with the original structure remaining dominant. This feature has been largely maintained.

HPC recommendations. (1) If practically feasible, lower of the cross gable peak to make it no higher than the original cottage to increase the compatibility with the neighborhood, historic district, and existing structure (2) If it becomes necessary to replace some of the original exterior details, replicate in kind and character. (3) Extend eave line of the south side of the original cottage past the new dormer to break the mass of the dormer, help distinguish the original part of the house**,** and reinforce the one story eave line.

Gail Littlefield
for the Historic Preservation Commission

Please note that the Historic Preservation Commission acts only in an advisory capacity to both applicants and the Planning Commission. The reviews undertaken are designed to assist homeowners in their projects, to provide input to deliberations of the Planning Commission and, more generally, to contribute to historic preservation in Washington Grove.

Further information regarding the scope, powers, duties, and structure of the Historic Preservation Commission may be found in Article XV of the Code of Ordinances of the Town of Washington Grove. Section 5 (a) of Article XV describes the powers and duties of the Historic Preservation Commission in the building permit process. This section reads as follows:

The Commission shall review all applications for building permits filed with the Town Planning Commission which would involve any change to a structure or site visible from any public way for historical accuracy, integrity, or compatibility with the neighborhood and improvements therein. The Commission may recommend to an applicant alternative historical designs, materials and sources for the same which may be more historically compatible, The Commission shall forward its recommendations regarding the same, if any, in an advisory capacity, to the Planning Commission for consideration by the Planning Commission within thirty (30) days from the Commission's receipt of the application from the Planning Commission.

cc: Applicant
HPC members
HPC Binder
Web site, Bill Saar
Planning Commission Chair
Mayor
Town Clerk